



## Final assessment on the fulfillment of recommendations presented in the report: Respect for human rights of residents in the Public Institution "Komanski most"



Ambasada Savezne Republike Njemačke Podgorica

Podgorica, February 2013

This document was created with financial assistance from the European Union and the Embassy of the Federal Republic of Germany in Podgorica. Contents of the document are the sole responsibility of Human Rights Action and in no way reflect the opinions of donors.

## Introduction

As part of the project "Monitoring Respect for Human Rights in Closed Institutions in Montenegro"<sup>1</sup>, on 1 November 2012 NGOs Human Rights Action (HRA), the project leader, Centre for Anti-discrimination "EQUISTA", Centre for Civic Education (CCE) and Women's Safe House (Shelter) published the report Respect for human rights of residents in the Public Institution "Komanski most" (hereinafter: the Report).<sup>2</sup>

The Report presents the degree of implementation of 30 recommendations of the European Committee for the Prevention of Torture and Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment of the Council of Europe (CPT) aimed at the promotion of the respect for human rights of residents placed at the Komanski Most Institution, set forth in the Report to the Government of Montenegro on the visit to Montenegro carried out by the Committee from 15 to 22 September 2008, as well as 10 recommendations of the Protector of Human Rights and Freedoms (Ombudsman) of Montenegro set forth in the Report of the Ombudsman on the human rights of mentally ill persons placed in institutions in March 2011. Within the conclusions of the Report, NGO monitoring team gave a total of 50 recommendations, some of which are repeated recommendations of the CPT and Ombudsman. Recommendations are addressed to: Director of the Komanski Most Institution, Ministry of Health, Ministry of Labour and Social Welfare and Ministry of Finance, with the aim to protect and improve the respect for human rights of people with intellectual disabilities placed in this facility.

More than a year after the publication of the Report with recommendations, in February 2013 the monitoring team of NGOs made a final assessment on the fulfillment of recommendations.

Final assessment of the fulfillment of recommendations contained in the Report is based on the following sources of information:

- 1. responses received from the Director of the Komanski Most Institution (hereinafter: the Institution);
- 2. responses received from the Ministry of Labour and Social Welfare;<sup>3</sup>
- 3. responses received from the Ministry of Health;<sup>4</sup>
- 4. data collected during an unannounced visit to the Institution carried out on 23 March 2012;<sup>5</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Details about the project available at: <u>http://www.hraction.org/?p=1444</u>.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> Report with recommendations available at: <u>http://www.hraction.org/wp-content/uploads/Report-Komanski\_Most\_Institution.pdf</u>.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> Response of the Ministry of Labour and Social Welfare no. 56-65/2013 of 6 February 2013.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> Response of the Ministry of Health to HRA of 13 February 2013.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> Visit conducted by project coordinator assistant Maja Raičević and monitor Jovana Hajduković, social worker.

- 5. data collected during visits to the Institution carried out on 3 and 24 August 2012;6
- 6. data collected during a visit to the Institution carried out on 23 January 2013;7
- 7. data collected during a visit to the Institution carried out on 31 January 2013;8
- 8. data collected during an unannounced visit to the Institution carried out on 13 February 2013;9
- 9. interviews with residents.

Below is a table containing recommendations and assessment of their implementation.

NOTE: Each recommendation specifies a body that made the recommendation.

Abbreviations:

CPT – European Committee for the Prevention of Torture and Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment

Ombudsman – Protector of Human Rights and Freedoms of Montenegro

MT – NGO monitoring team

Report – Report on the respect for human rights of residents in the Public Institution "Komanski most" of 1 November 2011.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup> Visit conducted by Maja Raičević, project coordinator assistant.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>7</sup> Visit conducted by project coordinator assistant Maja Raičević and monitor Jovana Hajduković, social worker.

<sup>8</sup> Visit conducted by Maja Raičević and Milan Šaranović, project coordinator assistants, and monitor Jovana Hajduković, social worker.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>9</sup> Visit conducted by project coordinator assistant Maja Raičević and monitor Jovana Hajduković, social worker.

## Assessment of the fulfillment of recommendations relating to the Public Institution "Komanski most" (hereinafter: the Institution)

Of a total of 50 recommendations of the NGO monitoring team, 21 were fully implemented (42%), 17 partially (34%), while 12 recommendations were not implemented (24%).

As regards CPT recommendations from 2009, 16 were fully implemented (53.33%), 10 recommendations partially (33.33%), 4 were not implemented (13.33%).

| No. | Recommendation addressed to:   | Recommendation  | Current situation   | Assessment of the fulfillment |
|-----|--------------------------------|---|---|-------------------------------|
|     |                                | Residents' liv  | ing conditions  |                               |
| 1.  | Director of the<br>Institution | Provide funds to construct a gym and<br>premises for physical therapy. (MT) | Room for physical therapy and<br>kinesiotherapy has been provided.<br>Physiotherapy equipment was donated<br>by the UN in Montenegro as part of the<br>project "Delivering as One". The room<br>is equipped with electrical apparatus for<br>current therapy and assistive devices<br>such as static bicycle, treadmill,<br>massage bed, hydraulic bed suitable for<br>wheelchair users, exercise mats, large<br>gymnastic balls, rollers and ladders.<br>In addition to electrical therapy,<br>ultrasound therapy is also applied, as<br>well as electrical stimulation. | Recommendation fulfilled.     |

| 2. | Director of the<br>Institution | Improve the care of immobile residents<br>and assist staff in the work with them<br>by providing safety belts for<br>wheelchairs, gurneys, mobile platforms<br>for lowering and raising residents from<br>a bathtub and mobile sinks. (MT) | <ul> <li>Wheelchairs and seat belts have been provided for all adult wheelchair users through the Health Insurance Fund.</li> <li>Mobile platform for lowering and raising wheelchairs users was provided through donations.</li> <li>However, one girl in a wheelchair has not been provided a seat belt.</li> </ul> | Recommendation almost<br>fully met.    |
|----|--------------------------------|--|---|--|
| 3. | Director of the<br>Institution | Refurbish common room in Ward A to<br>make it more comfortable for the<br>residents and meet their needs and<br>abilities. Wash or paint the walls. (MT)   | During our visit, residents were sitting<br>on the floor on mattresses. <sup>10</sup> Also, staff<br>members were painting the walls in<br>Ward A. <sup>11</sup>  | Recommendation fulfilled.              |
| 4. | Director of the<br>Institution | Equip the Institution's yard with<br>adequate inventory for recreation of<br>adults. (MT)  | Director informed us that negotiations<br>with the Ministry of Labour and Social<br>Welfare to provide funds for the yard<br>equipment are ongoing. Funds for the<br>construction of a greenhouse have<br>been provided.  | Recommendation partially<br>fulfilled. |
| 5. | Director of the<br>Institution | Provide adequate wheelchair ramp in the children's yard. (MT)  | Wheelchair ramp in the children's yard has been provided.   | Recommendation fulfilled.              |

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>10</sup> See the Report, p. 8.
<sup>11</sup> Ward A was renovated two years ago, however, the management informed us that the roof is leaking and that necessary repairs to the roof need to be done in the said Ward, which requires additional funds. The plan is to also build a shelter that would connect the wards with kitchen, so that residents have a shelter in case of inclement weather.

| 6. | Director of the<br>Institution | Start the planned kitchen renovation as<br>soon as possible, provide for a<br>dishwasher and potato peeler to<br>reduce the issue of support staff<br>shortage and facilitate the work of<br>residents engaged in the kitchen.<br>(Ombudsman, MT)                                | Kitchen has been renovated and<br>dishwasher and potato peeler have<br>been provided.  | Recommendation fulfilled.   |  |  |
|----|--------------------------------|--|--|---|--|--|
| 7. | Director of the<br>Institution | Ensure the right to privacy of the<br>Institution's residents by making sure<br>that staff do not change and unclothe<br>residents in front of others and by<br>providing lockable space for residents'<br>personal belongings, in accordance<br>with their abilities. (CPT, MT) | Space has been personalized. During<br>the visits we did not notice that<br>residents change their clothes in front<br>of others.  | <b>Recommendation fulfilled</b><br>bearing in mind that not all<br>residents, who can use it,<br>have been provided with<br>lockable space. |  |  |
| 8. | Director of the<br>Institution | Improve personal hygiene of children<br>by giving them a bath at least twice a<br>week. (MT)   | Staff informed us that the recommendation is put into practice. During the visits, the hygiene of children was satisfactory.   | Recommendation fulfilled.   |  |  |
| 9. | Director of the<br>Institution | Provide wheelchair users with<br>adequate assistive devices and ensure<br>that all access points and entrances be<br>adapted for wheelchair users. (MT)  | Recommendation implemented in<br>practice. Ward A has been equipped<br>with two elevators adapted for<br>wheelchair users. Elevators were<br>donated by the First Bank of<br>Montenegro. | Recommendation fulfilled.   |  |  |
|    | Institution staff              |  |  |   |  |  |

| 10. | Director of the | Employ a psychologist, pedagogue         | In the period since the publication of the         | The recommendation is             |
|-----|-----------------|--|--|-----------------------------------|
| 10. |                 |  | report until February 2013, the following          |                                   |
|     | Institution     | (andragogist) and three more carers, in  | personnel have been employed: three                | almost completely fulfilled.      |
|     |                 | accordance with the current Rulebook     | carers, two charwomen and a laundry                | However, it is necessary to       |
|     |                 | on internal organization and job         | person. In addition to 3 external                  | engage an oligophrenologist.      |
|     |                 | classification in the Public Institution | consultant physicians - chosen                     | The Institution has published a   |
|     |                 | "Komanski most". Consider hiring         | doctor, <sup>14</sup> occupational medicine        | vacancy announcement for          |
|     |                 | additional staff. (CPT12,                | specialist and neuropsychiatrist, as well          | this position, but, in the words  |
|     |                 | Ombudsman13, MT).                        | as a dentist <sup>15</sup> , four more consultants | of the Director, there is a       |
|     |                 |  | have been engaged: gynecologist <sup>16</sup> ,    | shortage of experts in this field |
|     |                 |  | orthopedist, physiatrist, physical                 | and the Employment Bureau         |
|     |                 |  | therapist and neurologist.                         | of Montenegro did not register    |
|     |                 |  | As part of the professional development            | any unemployed person with        |
|     |                 |  | program at the Institution, eight interns          | this degree. Therefore, the       |
|     |                 |  | started their internship on 15 January             | vacancy announcement shall        |
|     |                 |  | 2013, of the following profiles:                   | remain open.                      |
|     |                 |  | psychologist, pedagogue, defectologist,            |                                   |
|     |                 |  | three social workers, political scientist -        |                                   |
|     |                 |  | major in international relations and               |                                   |
|     |                 |  | graphic designer. <sup>17</sup>                    |                                   |
|     |                 |  | It is also necessary to hire an                    |                                   |
|     |                 |  | oligophrenologist at the Institution.              |                                   |

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>12</sup> "The numbers of staff in direct contact with residents should be substantially increased, including nurses, educators, work therapists, social workers, etc" (p. 126), CPT Report on its 2008 visit to Montenegro.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>13</sup> Take all necessary measures to ensure a sufficient number of specialized staff and employees who have direct contact with residents (nurses, educators, carers, occupational therapy specialists, social workers), as well as support staff.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>14</sup> See recommendation no. 33.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>15</sup> See recommendation no. 32.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>16</sup> See recommendation no. 34.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>17</sup> During our visit on 23 January 2013, intems were in the wards, in direct contact with residents. Graphic designer painted the walls of the living room in Ward C. Employees say they have been relieved and that it is easier to work with residents with the help of interns. In an interview Director of the Institution told us that after the internship period is over he will seek the approval of the Ministry of Finance to employ those interns who show interest in the work at the Institution.

| 11. | Director of the<br>Institution | Provide for adequate number of staff<br>during the vacation season as well, by<br>engaging people with appropriate<br>qualifications registered with the<br>Employment Bureau of Montenegro.<br>Enhance cooperation with the<br>secondary medical school and Faculty<br>of Medicine (MT). | In accordance with the Rulebook on<br>internal organization and job<br>classification, another 10 people were<br>employed in 2012, while eight interns<br>were engaged as of 15 January. During<br>afternoon visits we noticed that the<br>number of staff is smaller compared to<br>the morning shift, as well as the lack of<br>sufficient number of staff in the kitchen<br>and Ward C. Also, there is still only one<br>person in the kitchen in the afternoon<br>shift, so the lack of personnel is<br>compensated by engaging residents,<br>who work during the entire day, with<br>breaks. | Recommendation partially<br>fulfilled, since the cooperation<br>with the secondary medical<br>school and Faculty of<br>Medicine remained at the<br>same level. |
|-----|--------------------------------|---|---|--|
| 12. | Director of the<br>Institution | Prevent the practice where one<br>employee works a 12-hour shift alone<br>with ten children. (MT).  | During the afternoon visits, including<br>the last one carried out on 13 February<br>2013, we found that only one carer is<br>engaged in the children's ward during<br>the afternoon shift, which is inadequate,<br>given the needs of children.  | Recommendation not<br>fulfilled.   |
| 13. | Director of the<br>Institution | Additionally motivate employees by providing them with expert consulting support, supervision, performance  | According to staff, wages have<br>remained the same as before, and<br>there are no benefits for work in difficult   | Recommendation partially<br>fulfilled, because employees<br>have not been provided with  |

|     |                                | evaluation and adequate remuneration<br>for work in difficult conditions. (MT,<br>CPT <sup>18</sup> )  | conditions.<br>Visit from a consultant from Finland,<br>engaged by the UNDP under the<br>project aimed at the transformation of<br>the Institution, has proven the<br>importance of this type of staff support.<br>In staff's opinion, her stay at the<br>Institution and her expertise helped<br>them solve professional dilemmas and<br>provided confirmation of good practices<br>that exist at the Institution.   | continuous professional<br>consulting support and<br>supervision. Also, the wages<br>remain the same. |
|-----|--------------------------------|--|---|---|
| 14. | Director of the<br>Institution | Conduct ongoing training for all staff at<br>the Institution, which would include<br>specialized training concerning the<br>daily care of residents and<br>improvement of their capabilities, as<br>well as training on their rights, in order<br>to raise the level of professionalism<br>and improve the treatment of residents. | Specific trainings were held at the<br>Institution from 30 November to 2<br>December 2011, which included the<br>following topics:<br>- health, motivation and well-being of<br>staff and vocational rehabilitation at the<br>workplace,<br>- mental health and behaviour in order<br>to adapt,<br>- behaviour problems, challenging<br>behaviour, stereotypes,<br>- work with people with a pronounced<br>need for support,<br>- alternative communication,<br>- sex education.<br>The lecturer was Ms. Jelena<br>Vahakuopus, UNDP consultant in the | Recommendation fulfilled.   |

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>18</sup> "The CPT recommends that the Montenegrin authorities explore the possibilities of providing enhanced conditions of service for staff, so as to facilitate appropriate staff recruitment and retention, and offer both initial and ongoing training to staff (p. 126)", CPT Report on its 2008 visit to Montenegro.

|     |                                |  | project aimed at the Institution's<br>transformation.<br>On 29 November 2011 training was<br>held at the Institution for its employees<br>and representatives of social welfare<br>centres, on the following topics:<br>Convention on the Rights of Persons<br>with Disabilities and the current legal<br>issues in this area, as well as the<br>Definition of intellectual disability and<br>basic questions in rehabilitation.<br>Lecturers were Ms. Jelena Vahakuopus<br>and Mr. Siniša Bjeković.<br>In addition to mentioned trainings, study<br>visits were organized to similar<br>institutions in Germany, Finland and<br>Serbia. |                           |
|-----|--------------------------------|--|--|---------------------------|
| 15. | Director of the<br>Institution | Ensure proper equipment for the care<br>of immobile residents that would<br>facilitate employees' work with them in<br>a physical sense. (MT)  | Recommendations are put into practice.<br>See recommendations no. 2 and no. 9.   | Recommendation fulfilled. |
| 16. | Director of the<br>Institution | Engage additional male staff. "Carers"<br>do not have to be women only,<br>especially bearing in mind that<br>Komanski Most Institution<br>accommodates more male than female<br>residents (64:47). (MT) | Since the publication of the Report, one<br>nurse was employed and engaged in<br>Ward A.   | Recommendation fulfilled. |

|     | III-treatment and means of restraint |  |   |  |  |
|-----|--------------------------------------|--|---|--|--|
| 17. | Director of the<br>Institution       | Train staff to use appropriate<br>techniques to prevent residents'<br>aggressive behaviour. (Ombudsman,<br>MT).  | Situation remained unchanged.   | Recommendation not<br>fulfilled.       |  |
| 18. | Director of the<br>Institution       | Introduce additional guarantees for the<br>use of chemical restraint. For example,<br>introduce a separate register for<br>ampoule treatment for recording time,<br>type, dose and circumstances for the<br>application of ampoule treatment,<br>name of the doctor who ordered the<br>treatment and nurse who applied such<br>treatment. Data on received ampoule<br>therapy should be entered in residents'<br>medical records. (CPT, MT). | Situation remained unchanged. There<br>is still only a notebook for recording all<br>administered therapies (Report, p. 18).  | Recommendation not<br>fulfilled.       |  |
| 19. | Director of the<br>Institution       | Introduce the same guarantees for the<br>use of mechanical restraint - establish<br>a register of fixation. (MT)<br>Take further steps to ensure that a<br>comprehensive and clearly-defined<br>policy on the use of such means is<br>introduced (p. 129). (CPT)   | Staff at the Institution pointed out that<br>they do not resort to mechanical<br>restraint. Drafting of the Rulebook on<br>the application of isolation room is in<br>progress. | Recommendation partially<br>fulfilled. |  |
| 20. | Director of the<br>Institution       | Train staff in order to prevent residents'<br>self-harm, particularly in autistic<br>people, and provide technical means<br>used for that purpose in the developed<br>countries. (MT)  | Isolation room and sensory room that<br>can also serve this purpose were<br>provided, but additional training for staff<br>is needed.   | Recommendation partially<br>fulfilled. |  |

|     |                                | Montenegrin authorities to take<br>appropriate steps to protect residents<br>from other residents who might cause<br>them harm (p. 112). (CPT)   |  |  |
|-----|--------------------------------|--|--|--|
| 21. | Director of the<br>Institution | Provide an isolation room with padded<br>walls, where the residents would be<br>placed in the case of agitation. (MT)<br>Committee wishes to stress that<br>seclusion should never be used as a<br>punishment vis-à-vis mentally disabled<br>persons (p. 127). (CPT)                           | Equipping of isolation room is in the<br>final stage, the only task left is to set up<br>a ventilation system. Drafting of the<br>Rulebook on the application of isolation<br>room is in progress.   | Recommendation fulfilled.  |
|     |                                | Treatment o  | of residents   |  |
| 22. | Director of the<br>Institution | Improve the existing and introduce<br>additional work, educational and<br>recreational activities for residents.<br>Create activities for all residents,<br>including for persons with profound<br>intellectual disabilities and those with<br>motor disturbance. (CPT19,<br>Obmudsman20, MT). | Opportunities for indoor recreation have<br>significantly improved after equipping<br>the room for physiotherapy, which<br>includes modern exercise equipment.<br>Institution accommodates about 40<br>residents capable of working. However,<br>occupational therapy has not improved<br>and no new activities were introduced.<br>On the contrary, some of the earlier | Recommendation fulfilled inthe part related to sports andrecreational activities forresidents.However, therecommendation was notfulfilled with regard toworking and educationalactivities, because not |

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>19</sup> It is desirable to offer residents education and suitable work, the aim being to prepare residents for independent or at least more autonomous living (p. 122); CPT recommends that the Montenegrin authorities make efforts to ensure the implementation of the individual treatment and rehabilitation plans by involving all residents in activities adapted to their needs. Achieving this goal will require recruiting more qualified staff (p. 122), CPT Report on its 2008 visit to Montenegro.
<sup>20</sup> Take all necessary measures for the development of individual work programs for all adult residents in the Institution "Komanski most" and their involvement in occupational

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>20</sup> Take all necessary measures for the development of individual work programs for all adult residents in the Institution "Komanski most" and their involvement in occupational therapy.

|  | programe have been pearly evenended        | analish attention is noted to    |
|--|--|----------------------------------|
|  | programs have been nearly suspended        | enough attention is paid to      |
|  | due to a lack of working material, but     | occupational therapy, although   |
|  | are still performed only owing to the      | it would greatly contribute to   |
|  | good will of occupational therapists who   | the welfare and progress of      |
|  | are coping with the situation using        | residents and the very           |
|  | materials from nature where residents      | Institution.                     |
|  | intervene artistically, creating icons and | Furthermore, persons with        |
|  | figures of wood. We suggest that these     | severe intellectual disabilities |
|  | interesting handicrafts be used as         | are still not engaged in any     |
|  | decorations on the walls in the            | type of activities. It is also   |
|  | Administrative building and displayed at   | necessary to ensure outdoor      |
|  | a public exhibition. In this manner the    | recreation, which would mainly   |
|  | Institution would valorise the work of its | be achieved through the          |
|  | residents, sensitize the public and        | orchard maintenance. It is       |
|  | collect funds for the working material.    | necessary to further improve     |
|  | While collecting the funds for             | and enhance both educational     |
|  | construction of a greenhouse is            | and working activities, and      |
|  | commendable, it is also important not to   | regularly supply workshops       |
|  | neglect an orchard located behind the      | with the working material.21     |
|  | wards. Orchard maintenance would           |                                  |
|  | have multiple benefits for residents'      |                                  |
|  | stay outdoors and working                  |                                  |
|  | arrangement, as well as for the            |                                  |
|  | Institution's grocery supply. Also, we     |                                  |
|  | noted that physical labour, such as        |                                  |
|  | work in the kitchen and laundry room,      |                                  |
|  | are treated as occupational therapy and    |                                  |
|  | 1 115                                      | 1                                |

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>21</sup> See recommendations no. 25 and no. 26.

| 23. | Director of the<br>Institution | For the purpose of socialization of people with intellectual disabilities,   | are often the only form of engagement<br>of residents.<br>Recommendation implemented in<br>practice, however, activities outside the  | Recommendation partially fulfilled.               |
|-----|--------------------------------|--|---|---|
|     |                                | devote more attention to leisure<br>activities and enrich them with various<br>sports, recreational, cultural and artistic<br>events, outside the Institution as well.<br>(CPT <sub>22</sub> , MT)   | Institution should be more frequent and involve a larger number of residents. <sup>23</sup>   |   |
| 24. | Director of the<br>Institution | Provide residents with the opportunity<br>to decide on matters concerning<br>themselves, such as activities<br>programs and schedules, decoration of<br>the premises in which they reside, as<br>well as of the exterior of the Institution.<br>(MT) | In an interview with residents we learnt<br>that they do not receive an allowance,<br>or receive an amount smaller than<br>prescribed. A resident working as a<br>gatekeeper at the Institution's gate<br>receives a €20 monthly salary, while<br>residents engaged in the kitchen and<br>laundry room do not receive<br>compensation for their work. | Recommendation partially<br>fulfilled.            |
| 25. | Director of the<br>Institution | Equip workshops for resident's occupational therapy. (MT)  | During the visit on 23 March 2012 we found a group of female residents in   | Recommendation not<br>fulfilled, because no funds |
|     |                                |  | occupational therapy which included   | have been invested in                             |

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>22</sup> CPT recommends that steps be taken to offer all residents, health permitting, at least one hour a day of outdoor exercise in a reasonably spacious setting, which should also offer shelter from inclement weather (p. 122), CPT Report on its 2008 visit to Montenegro.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>23</sup>This year, a seven-day stay at the resort on Ivanova korita has been provided for 24 residents.

In August 2012 residents of the Institution attended the event "Montenegrin Ethno Festival 2012", and in October 2012 they visited the airline company Montenegro Airlines. Also, in August 2012 members of the monitoring team, in cooperation with the Institution's management organized a trip to beach Velika plaža. Prior to the New Year holidays residents visited "Delta City" shopping mall. It is crucial to continue with this practice and collaborate with as many different organizations, to offer residents more diverse activities.

| 26. | Director of the<br>Institution | Encourage staff to implement as many<br>programs and activities as possible in<br>the work with residents, in order to<br>increase the level of residents'<br>functionality. (MT) | knitting and tapestry-making using wool<br>yarn. However, in the meantime the<br>lack of materials for the work almost led<br>to the suspension of this activity.<br>The existing workshop for making<br>cardboard does not operate because of<br>the inability to place products on the<br>market. For unknown reasons, the<br>activity of making fuel material from<br>discarded wooden crates, improvised<br>by occupational therapists and enjoyed<br>by residents, has also been suspended.<br>Activities such as occupational therapy<br>need to be improved and staff provided<br>with necessary material and conditions<br>for the work with residents. Also, efforts<br>should be made to reorganize<br>personnel within the Institution in order<br>to engage occupational therapists<br>trained for that job. | equipping workshops or, in<br>general, in occupational<br>therapy. |
|-----|--------------------------------|---|--|--|
| 27. | Director of the<br>Institution | Introduce new therapeutic methods<br>following the example of developed<br>countries (e.g. sensory room where the<br>treatment is carried out in isolation                        | During the last visit we saw a sensory<br>room, equipped in accordance with<br>European standards - according to<br>staff. <sup>24</sup>   | Recommendation fulfilled.  |

 $<sup>^{24}</sup>$  Director said that in the forthcoming period it is necessary to provide funding for professional training of at least two persons in Belgrade or in Zagreb (three-week training per employee amounts to  $\in$  1200).

|     |   | from external influences of light and<br>sound, with the aim to stimulate the<br>senses, especially in children. This<br>method encourages proper<br>development of experience of the<br>outside world, controls aggression and<br>relaxes the child). (MT)       |   |  |
|-----|---|---|---|--|
| 28. | Director of the<br>Institution              | Ensure stay at the seaside or<br>occasional trips outside the Institution<br>for all residents whose psycho-physical<br>abilities allow for such activities and<br>interaction with the local community.<br>(MT)  | Recommendation implemented in practice. <sup>25</sup>   | Recommendation fulfilled.                          |
| 29. | Director of the<br>Institution              | Engage volunteers to assist staff with<br>the proposed activities. Encourage<br>educational institutions, NGOs and<br>other civil society organizations, as<br>well as potential donors to cooperate<br>with Komanski Most Institution and its<br>residents. (MT) | There are still no volunteers engaged at<br>the Institution, however, the fact that<br>residents' living conditions have<br>improved significantly and that activities<br>of NGOs involved in the Institution's<br>activities have media coverage<br>encourage initiatives of this type, which<br>should be continuously supported. | Recommendation partially<br>fulfilled.             |
|     |   | Healthcare  |   |  |
| 30. | Director of the<br>Institution and Ministry | Provide equal health care to residents of the Institution and to other  | 1) Procedure of obtaining health cards for all residents has been completed.  | Recommendation partially<br>fulfilled, because the |

<sup>25</sup> See recommendation no. 23.

|     | of Health                      | <ul> <li>policyholders. To this end, above all:</li> <li>1) provide health cards for all residents without further delay,</li> <li>2) provide adequate resources to finance the cost of procurement of medicines for residents which are not included in the Health Insurance Fund list, as well as other means of treatment, and</li> <li>3) provide training for specialized staff at the Clinical Centre of Montenegro in order to properly treat children and adults with intellectual disabilities. (CPT<sup>26</sup>, MT)</li> </ul> | <ol> <li>2) Situation remained unchanged.</li> <li>3) Situation remained unchanged.</li> </ol>  | Institution still funds the cost of<br>procurement of medicines<br>which are not included in the<br>Health Insurance Fund list.<br>Also, training for specialized<br>staff at the Clinical Centre of<br>Montenegro on proper<br>treatment of children and<br>adults with intellectual<br>disabilities has not been<br>provided.<br>However, according to the<br>medical staff at the Institution,<br>cooperation with the staff of<br>the Clinical Centre of<br>Montenegro Hospital is at a<br>high level. |
|-----|--------------------------------|--|---|--|
| 31. | Ministry of Health             | Ministry of Health should adopt<br>relevant regulations and ensure<br>registration of the Institution's clinic in<br>accordance with Art. 78 of the Law on<br>Healthcare, which would imply new job<br>classification and its equipping in<br>accordance with the regulations. (MT)  | By-law relating to the registration of<br>Institution's clinic was not adopted.<br>According to the response of the<br>Ministry of Health, drafting of the Law<br>on Healthcare is planned for the second<br>quarter of this year, so it is possible that<br>some amendments will include the<br>provision of Article 78. <sup>27</sup> | Recommendation not<br>fulfilled.   |
| 32. | Director of the<br>Institution | Raise the level of dental care at the Institution as soon as possible and  | New dentist was hired and dental care of residents improved.  | Recommendation fulfilled.  |

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>26</sup> The treatment of mentally disabled persons should involve a wide range of therapeutic, rehabilitative and recreational activities, such as access to appropriate medication and medical care, occupational therapy, group therapy, individual psychotherapy, art, drama, music and sports. Residents should have regular access to suitably-equipped recreation rooms and have the possibility to take outdoor exercise on a daily basis (p. 122), CPT Report on its 2008 visit to Montenegro. <sup>27</sup> Response of the Ministry of Health to Human Rights Action of 13 February 2012.

| 33. | Director of the<br>Institution                           | introduce regular medical<br>examinations. (MT)<br>Hire a full-time general practitioner, or<br>as a minimum engage external general<br>practitioner with the significantly<br>increased number of hours spent at the<br>Institution as compared to the current<br>situation. (MT) | Director of the Institution informed us<br>that the Ministry of Finance provided its<br>approval for engaging a general<br>practitioner, <sup>28</sup> as well as another head<br>nurse.                     | Recommendation fulfilled.  |
|-----|--|--|--|--|
| 34. | Director of the<br>Institution                           | Engage another external expert –<br>gynaecologist, as soon as possible.<br>(MT)  | Gynecologist has been engaged and<br>regularly performs examinations in the<br>newly equipped gynecological clinic. <sup>29</sup>  | Recommendation fulfilled.  |
| 35. | Ministry of Health                                       | Connect internal Institution's medical<br>database containing medical records of<br>patients with the public healthcare<br>database and develop appropriate<br>protocols that will allow the continuity<br>of residents' healthcare regardless of<br>staffing solutions. (MT)      | Situation remained unchanged. See the<br>Report, p. 25.<br>provjeriti kod dr. Grbovica   | Recommendation not<br>fulfilled.   |
| 36. | Director of the<br>Institution and Ministry<br>of Health | Ensure appropriate therapy for<br>residents suffering from cancer.<br>Healthcare should also be preventive.<br>Include residents in the mandatory  | According to the Director, there are no<br>residents with cancer in the Institution<br>at the moment. Residents were not<br>included in mandatory screening tests,<br>but during the last year all residents | <b>Recommendation partially</b><br><u><b>fulfilled</b></u> , because residents<br>were not included in<br>mandatory screening tests. |

 <sup>&</sup>lt;sup>28</sup> Director expressed his concern because persons with adequate degree of education - doctors of general medicine - have no interest in working at the Institution and no person applied for the vacancy announcement. Vacancy announcement for this position will be republished.
 <sup>29</sup> Gynecology clinic opened in late 2012. According to staff and information provided in the Work Report for 2012 (Report available at ....), full medical examination of the entire female population was conducted and appropriate therapy administered, laboratory analyses were carried out, as well as 20% of follow-up examinations.

|     |  | screening tests that are now part of the<br>basic primary healthcare package.<br>(MT)   | underwent full medical check-ups,<br>including laboratory, X-ray examination<br>and internist examination. All residents<br>underwent full medical check-up and<br>received therapy determined by a<br>neuropsychiatrist, including also<br>neurologist examination, laboratory for<br>diagnostic purposes. <sup>30</sup> |   |
|-----|--|---|---|---|
| 37. | Ministry of Health                       | Define the legal obligation to perform<br>an autopsy on persons who pass away<br>in the Institution in accordance with Art.<br>128 of the Law on Healthcare. It is<br>essential that the Ministry of Health<br>adopt rules that regulate the work of a<br>coroner. (MT) | Situation remained unchanged. <sup>31</sup>   | Recommendation not<br>fulfilled.  |
|     |  | Contact with family and   | I community members   |   |
| 38. | Ministry of Labour and<br>Social Welfare | Establish an independent body to<br>monitor the work of the Institution and<br>ensure participation of residents'<br>parents in its work, as well as in the<br>Governing Board of the Institution.<br>(MT)  | Situation remained unchanged. On 3<br>December 2012 a meeting was held<br>with residents' parents, i.e. guardians.<br>They were familiarized with the work of<br>the Institution and given an opportunity<br>to express their comments and<br>suggestions.  | Recommendation not<br>fulfilled, because the parents<br>should at least be allowed to<br>participate equally in the work<br>of the Governing Board of the<br>Institution. |

<sup>30</sup> Work Report for 2012.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>31</sup> Ministry of Health's response to Human Rights Action of 13 February 2013 states: As regards the rulebook on the work of a coroner, we wish to point out that the obligation of performing an autopsy of a person who died in the hospital, in accordance with applicable law, if the exact cause of death was not determined, applies to all hospitals, including thus special hospitals; by-law, which is in the process of drafting, will closely regulate, among other things, the manner of reporting on such persons.

| 39. | Director of the<br>Institution           | Establish cooperation with different<br>organizations in order to organize<br>sports, cultural, recreational and<br>entertaining activities for residents, e.g.<br>out-of-town trips or trips to the city,<br>shows, concerts and sporting events.<br>(CPT <sup>32</sup> , MT) | Recommendation put into practice. See<br>recommendation no. 23.<br>We noted several positive examples of<br>cooperation between the Institution and<br>individuals and groups of citizens <sup>33</sup> , in<br>order to raise funds for the Institution<br>and involve residents in cultural events<br>to a greater extent. This practice needs<br>to be further developed.   | Recommendation fulfilled.              |
|-----|--|--|--|--|
| 40. | Ministry of Labour and<br>Social Welfare | Organize public campaign and raise<br>the awareness about persons with<br>intellectual disabilities with the help of<br>the media. (Ombudsman <sup>34</sup> , MT)  | Management of the Institution has<br>made significant efforts to increase the<br>transparency of its work and through<br>the previously mentioned activities<br>affect changes in public awareness and<br>reduce prejudice against people with<br>intellectual disabilities.<br>There is a need for greater support of<br>the Ministry of Labour and Social<br>Welfare in the development of a public<br>campaign that would further promote<br>the rights of this population. | Recommendation partially<br>fulfilled. |

 <sup>&</sup>lt;sup>32</sup> The CPT invites the Montenegrin authorities to pursue their efforts to encourage residents' contacts with the outside world, e.g. by means of inviting voluntary visitors, NGOs, etc. (p. 135), CPT Report on its 2008 visit to Montenegro.
 <sup>33</sup> More on these activities at: <u>http://juzkomanskimost.me</u>.
 <sup>34</sup> Take necessary action to inform the general public in order to eliminate prejudice against people with mental health issues.

| 41. | Director of the<br>Institution and Ministry<br>of Labour and Social<br>Welfare | Komanski Most Institution should<br>continue taking measures to<br>encourage family contact with the<br>residents, with the help of social<br>welfare centres. (MT)   | Recommendation implemented in practice. <sup>35</sup>  | Recommendation fulfilled.              |
|-----|--|---|--|--|
| 42. | Ministry of Labour and<br>Social Welfare                                       | Improve the quality of cooperation of<br>the Ministry of Labour and Social<br>Welfare, social welfare centres, local<br>community, secondary medical school<br>and faculties with the Institution. (MT)                     | Recommendation put into practice.<br>According to the Director, each month<br>at the premises of the Institution a<br>meeting is held with representatives of<br>the Ministry of Labour and Social<br>Welfare and representatives of all<br>social welfare centres. <sup>36</sup>  | Recommendation fulfilled.              |
| 43. | Ministry of Labour and<br>Social Welfare                                       | Take measures to open counselling<br>centres, mental health clinics and day<br>care centres, in order to help and<br>support people with intellectual<br>disabilities and their families.<br>(Ombudsman <sup>37</sup> , MT) | Through the project "Reform of social<br>and child care – social inclusion<br>improvement", implemented in<br>cooperation with UNDP and with<br>financial support from the European<br>Commission <sup>38</sup> , the Ministry drafted the<br>Review of the local social services in<br>Montenegro in 2012, which shows that<br>the majority of services have been | Recommendation partially<br>fulfilled. |

 <sup>&</sup>lt;sup>35</sup> Institution pays for travel costs of residents' parents (or guardians) from its own budget, in order to foster family contact. On 3 December 2011 a meeting was held at the premises of the Institution between residents' family members, parents or guardians and staff of the Institution.
 <sup>36</sup> Director stated that the Institution's cooperation with social welfare centres varies - from very correct cooperation to great tardiness of certain centres in resolving status issues

of residents. Director emphasized that the best cooperation has been established with Pljevlja Social Welfare Centre.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>37</sup> Take all necessary measures for the establishment and development of various support services to families with a mentally ill family member, at the local level.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>38</sup> Program IPA 2010.

|     |  | Status issues and oth   | aimed at the elderly, persons with<br>disabilities and children with disabilities.<br>It is necessary to ensure continuing<br>viability of these services and greater<br>representation of support services for<br>adults with intellectual disabilities. <sup>39</sup>  |                                  |
|-----|--|---|--|----------------------------------|
| 44. | Ministry of Labour and<br>Social Welfare | Ministry of Labour and Social Welfare<br>without delay to adopt by-laws to<br>specify the standards and procedures<br>for admission and stay of residents, as<br>well as for social support after<br>discharge from the Institution. (MT) | Procedures for referring, admitting and accommodating residents, as well as for providing social support after discharge from the Institution (Report, p. 40) still take place under the old Law on Social and Child Care from 2005 <sup>40</sup> and Ordinance on the essential requirements for basic rights to social protection. <sup>41</sup> New standards in the field of social and child care, including those pertaining to the Public Institution Komanski most, will be approved after the adoption of the new Law on Social and Child Care. <sup>42</sup> | Recommendation not<br>fulfilled. |

 <sup>&</sup>lt;sup>39</sup> Response of the Ministry of Labour and Social Welfare to Human Rights Action of 6 February 2013 states that "majority of the identified services have been aimed at the elderly, children with disabilities and people with disabilities".
 <sup>40</sup> SI. list RCG, 78/05.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>41</sup> SI. list RCG, 08/06.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>42</sup> Response of the Ministry of Labour and Social Welfare to Human Rights Action of 6 February 2013.

| 45  |                        |  |   |                                    |
|-----|------------------------|--|---|------------------------------------|
| 45. | Ministry of Labour and | Form an independent body to monitor      | Such body has not been created.           | Recommendation not                 |
|     | Social Welfare         | the procedures of determining            | Representatives of the Ministry of        | <u>fulfilled.</u>                  |
|     |                        | guardianship, categorization of          | Labour and Social Welfare believe that    | We remind that the Ministry's      |
|     |                        | persons prior to admission to the        | through the performance of activities by  | supervision has not been           |
|     |                        | Institution, re-categorization after the | the Institution, competent social welfare | sufficient to ensure that the      |
|     |                        | placement at the Institution, as well as | centres and the Ministry of Labour and    | situation in Komanski most is      |
|     |                        | the work of the Institution. Allow       | Social Welfare at the regular monthly     | not as appalling as described      |
|     |                        | residents' parents, experts and          | meetings, related to the development      | in the CPT Report from 2008.       |
|     |                        | representatives of civil society         | and monitoring of individual treatment    | Also, the procedures for           |
|     |                        | concerned with human rights to be        | plans for residents, they have covered    | determining legal capacity         |
|     |                        | involved in the work of this body. (MT)  | the monitoring of professional work in    | were not implemented in a          |
|     |                        |  | the Institution and relationship of the   | number of cases, without           |
|     |                        |  | parents/guardians and guardianship        | justification. Thus, this          |
|     |                        |  | authorities towards each resident         | Institution has been               |
|     |                        |  | individually.43                           | accommodating adults for a         |
|     |                        |  |   | long time period, who have not     |
|     |                        |  |   | yet been deprived of their legal   |
|     |                        |  |   | capacity or placed under           |
|     |                        |  |   | guardianship.44 Situation when     |
|     |                        |  |   | a closed-type institution holds    |
|     |                        |  |   | people irrespective of their will, |
|     |                        |  |   | without a court order, i.e. when   |
|     |                        |  |   | a court is unable to effectively   |
|     |                        |  |   | decide on the legality of their    |
|     |                        |  |   | stay in the institution - is in    |

 <sup>&</sup>lt;sup>43</sup> Response of the Ministry of Labour and Social Welfare to Human Rights Action of 6 February 2013.
 <sup>44</sup> Although the Work Program for 2011 in the Public Institution "Komanski most" indicates that the Institution admits only persons under guardianship.

| 46. | Director of the<br>Institution | Develop an information brochure with<br>the purpose of introducing the<br>residents' rights to employees at the<br>Institution, residents and their families.<br>(MT)  | Information brochure was developed,<br>however, it contains information about<br>the Institution and the services it offers,<br>not the human rights of its residents.  | violation of their human right to<br>freedom, guaranteed by<br>international treaties. <sup>45</sup><br><b>Recommendation partially</b><br><b>fulfilled</b> . Brochure by NGOs<br>involved in the project for<br>monitoring respect for human<br>rights at the Institution <sup>46</sup> is<br>currently being drafted; it will<br>include a section on the<br>human rights of residents and<br>information for parents. |
|-----|--------------------------------|--|---|--|
| 47. | Director of the<br>Institution | Provide for greater involvement of<br>residents and their families in decision-<br>making processes that affect them and<br>their stay at the Institution (e.g. allow<br>them to choose their roommate,<br>activities they want to practice, design<br>their living space; ensure that parents<br>representative be included in the<br>Governing Board of the Institution, etc).<br>(MT) | See recommendation no. 24.<br>In December 2012 the Institution<br>organized a meeting with residents'<br>parents, where they were able to<br>present their suggestions, comments<br>and observations. Still, this is not<br>enough to ensure their involvement in<br>making important decisions concerning<br>the residents and their stay in the<br>Institution. Similar meetings should also<br>be arranged with residents. | Recommendation partially<br>fulfilled.   |

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>45</sup> Art. 5, para 1, item e and para 4 of the European Convention for the Protection of Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms; Art. 9, para 1 of the International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>46</sup> Brochure will also be developed as part of the project "Monitoring Respect for Human Rights in Closed Institutions in Montenegro", funded by the European Commission and the German Embassy.

| 48. | Director of the<br>Institution and Ministry<br>of Labour and Social<br>Welfare | Regularly perform re-categorization of<br>persons placed at the Institution and<br>review the need for their further stay.<br>(MT)       | Recategorization of residents and<br>development of individual care plans<br>should be carried out following the<br>evaluation of the Working Group for<br>assessment of the type, form and<br>degree of a deficiency, disturbance or<br>disorder of the residents, formed by the<br>Ministry of Labour and Social Welfare in<br>2011. Individual care plans provide for<br>residents' placement under<br>guardianship or extension of parental<br>rights. Competent social welfare<br>centres initiated this procedure before<br>the competent courts for all residents of<br>the Institution; however, for some of<br>them the legal action is still pending.<br>The same notice was received while<br>working on the Report more than one<br>year ago. | Recommendation partially<br>fulfilled.   |
|-----|--|--|---|--|
| 49. | Director of the<br>Institution and Ministry<br>of Labour and Social<br>Welfare | Implement transitional planning<br>(transition projects: residential<br>communities, assisted living and half-<br>day or day room). (MT) | Although the Master Plan for the<br>transformation of child protection<br>service envisages the establishment of<br>a number of services to ensure<br>adequate placement of children<br>currently living in the institutions into<br>families and the community, as well as<br>services to prevent further admission to<br>the institutions, <sup>47</sup> this process has not<br>yet started. It is also necessary to<br>implement transitional planning for<br>adults within the Institution.  | <b><u>Recommendation partially</u></b><br><u>fulfilled</u> , because the<br>service transformation<br>plan refers only to<br>children. |

<sup>47</sup> Work Report for 2012.

| 50. | Ministry of Labour and<br>Social Welfare | Develop a system of social support for<br>adults with intellectual disabilities and<br>establish counselling centres, centres<br>for occupational training, protective<br>workshops, supported employment,<br>etc, in order to prevent<br>institutionalization. (MT) | Vocational rehabilitation and<br>employment of persons with disabilities<br>is regulated by a special law <sup>48</sup> and<br>accompanying regulations <sup>49</sup> that<br>prescribe the establishment of<br>Commissions for vocational<br>rehabilitation with employment bureaus.<br><u>Commissions established with the<br/>employment bureaus, which carry out<br/>the assessment of one's disability,<br/>remaining job skills and employment<br/>opportunities have been available only<br/>since July 2012, and in Podgorica only<br/>as of December 2012.<sup>50</sup> In addition,<br/>there are still no services that would<br/>allow application of the law, especially<br/>when it comes to people with<br/>intellectual disabilities.</u> | Recommendation not<br>fulfilled, because the previous<br>Government's efforts to build a<br>social support system referred<br>only to children, not adults with<br>intellectual disabilities. |
|-----|--|--|---|---|
|-----|--|--|---|---|

 <sup>&</sup>lt;sup>48</sup> Law on Vocational Rehabilitation and Employment of Disabled Persons (*SI. list RCG*, 49/08, 73/10, 39/11).
 <sup>49</sup> Rulebook on the conditions and criteria for determining the percentage of disability, work capacity and employment opportunities and Rulebook on amendments to the Rulebook on the composition and methods of work of the Commission for vocational rehabilitation.
 <sup>50</sup> Response of the Ministry of Labour and Social Welfare to Human Rights Action of 6 February 2013.

## **Conclusion**

We wish to commend the efforts of the Public Institution "Komanski most" and the Ministry of Labour and Social Welfare on the implementation of recommendations from our previous report, especially those outlined by the CPT in 2009 on the basis of its visit to the Institution in September 2008, related to the improvement of the living conditions of residents, adaptation and renovation of the wards and kitchen, increase in the number of employees in direct contact with residents, inadmissibility of physical and psychological abuse of residents and their fixation, etc. Equipping of a gynecological clinic, procurement of medical supplies and orthopedic devices and employment of four specialists from the field of medicine have significantly improved the health care of residents. Physiotherapy room has been equipped with modern fitness equipment and a physician was hired. Transparency in the work of the Institution has significantly improved and efforts were made to establish contact with the outside world and residents' families.

We commend the willingness of Institution's Director Mr. Vaselj Dušaj to cooperate with our team, as well as his personal commitment to mobilize the community to raise funds for the Institution. As a result, the Institution obtained a modern sensory room, mentioned in the previous report as an example of good practice in working with children with autism. Collaboration with the community and civic associations had an impact on raising social awareness about the population placed at the Institution, so there are more people of good will and organizations who wish to help this Institution.

However, further improvement is needed in the following areas:

- occupational therapy and treatment of residents, which remained at the same level as in the period of drafting the first report of the monitoring team, although this is a key component to the welfare and progress of residents and the Institution itself;
- transitional planning and creating of the conditions for supported housing for adult residents at the Institution;
- activities for immobile residents;
- greater involvement of residents and their parents or guardians in the work of the Institution and decision-making concerning both residents and the facility;

- encourage and motivate staff by providing them with the opportunity to improve the work with residents through their own recommendations and ensure better care for staff through provision of benefits, training, professional supervision and support of specialists;
- further improvement of understanding of the human rights of Institution's residents, which includes the right to humane attitude of staff towards residents and respect for their dignity, right to privacy and right to decision-making and self-representation to the highest possible extent.
- Ministry of Labour and Social Welfare needs to make further efforts to address the status issues of residents. It is necessary to adopt an
  ordinance as soon as possible in order to specify the procedures for referral, admission and stay of residents, as well as for providing social
  support after discharge from the Institution. Also, an independent body needs to be established to monitor the procedures of determining a
  guardian, categorization of persons prior to admission to the Institution, re-categorization following admission to the Institution, as well as the
  work of the Institution.

We believe that the Public Institution "Komanski most" has started the process of positive transformation from the institution where severe human rights violations had occurred, to the institution that cares about its residents and promotes their rights in the community.